

'Indigenous', 'tribal', 'nomadic': Categories, their constructions, and their analytical and political contents*Brian Donahoe*

The terms "indigenous," "tribal," and "nomadic" (and their calques and translations into other languages) all have their complicated histories and ideological baggage. To this one could add "native," "traditional," and (especially in the Russian case), "clan." These are all externally imposed terms used to describe and categorize certain others, purportedly on the basis of lifestyle, social organization, economic activities, and historical continuity in a given territory. In many cases the terms and categories were initially applied as a way of administering and controlling certain populations and imposing drastic lifestyle changes on them. More recently, however, those peoples to whom these externally imposed legal concepts and categories refer have struggled to make these terms work for them, but to do so they must frame their claims in those terms. In this presentation I want to look at two closely related processes: 1) What happens *cognitively* to people when drastic changes in the way they move through and relate to the land are imposed upon them? And 2), What happens *cognitively* when people have to dress their own thoughts in new language, or present their own experiences in terms different than those they would normally express them in, just to meet certain expectations and to fit certain externally constructed and imposed categories? Initially they may experience a *cognitive dissonance* that manifests itself in various forms of pathological behavior (violence, substance abuse, suicide). Over time, the terms and categories become internalized and naturalized and, I will argue, fundamentally change the way people perceive, cognize, and move through the land.

Where is Indigenous? State Productions of Indigenous Space (using the examples of the Russian and British Columbian Norths)*Gail Fondahl*

Societies produce the spaces in which they live through social practices of visualization, administration and use, as noted by Henri Lefebvre. States play a critical, though not total, role in such production of space. Through legal and regulatory mechanisms, states create the category of 'indigenous' or 'aboriginal' (i.e. *who* is officially indigenous), contributing to the shaping of contours of indigenous identity. Moreover, states are implicated in the formulation, formation, perpetuation and discipline that construct the spaces available to 'indigenous citizens' and 'indigenous activities'. In post-Soviet Russia, since 1991, the state's rewriting of the legislation pertaining to the rights of indigenous northerners (the so-called 'Small-numbered Peoples of the North') has exhibited revised visualizations of indigenous spatialities, visualizations that are now being administered and effected. In a very different context, but within the same time frame, Canada and British Columbia since 1990 have been grappling with the possible spatialities of indigenous territories, as they set about addressing the 'unfinished business' of treaty settlement in the province. This paper documents the new spatial visualizations across the legal landscape of Russia's and British Columbia's North, considering both federal and sub-federal laws pertaining to indigenous rights to territory, as they have evolved in the past two decades to narrate 'appropriate' geographies of indigeneity. Links implicated in the state productions of rurality, peripherality, traditionality and 'natural landscapes' with indigenous territoriality are also explored. Finally, the paper asks, to what extent do the spatial arrangements that these states have visualized and administered matter for indigenous human geographies?



'Reindeers don't care about the border'. Others may do: Sámi cross-border reindeer herding in northern Scandinavia*Peter Koch*

I will discuss the Norwegian-Swedish border conflict that arose after the 1972-border convention expired in 2005, which has regulated cross-border reindeer herding in Norway and Sweden. Since negotiations over a new convention started in 1997, different national delegations composed by representatives from the Norwegian and Swedish governments and respective national Sámi institutions failed in achieving a mutually accepted consent on pastoral land rights across the state border. The resistance of the local Sámi reindeer herding cooperatives against an agreement in which they see their pastoral land rights and thus their livelihoods in reindeer herding at risk appears to be a fundamental hindrance. While the actual line of the (particular) border is not challenged and thus has only a little or even no effect on human everyday practices and reindeer migration it still demonstrates the existence of two different state territories that nowadays humans have no other chance but to consider. Based on this territoriality the national states have created (distinct) legal husbandry regimes, intensive competitive reindeer industries, and thus citizenship identities also among the Sámi reindeer herders. The border consequently started to interfere in Sámi patterns of spatial conceptions and so became a central factor in the spatial and temporal management of pasturelands.

The Nellim forest conflict in Finnish Lapland: between state forest 'mapping' and local forest 'living'*Nuccio Mazzullo*

The Sámi people are the only indigenous group living in the Northern part of the Scandinavian Peninsula. Through a focus on the ethnographic case study of the Nellim community, situated in the North-east of Lapland, I intend to highlight some of the discursive dynamics that have shaped the conflict between the Finnish department of forestry and some members of the small community of the Nellim village. This conflict has mainly revolved around the access to resources in an overlapping territory, defined as state forest and managed by the forestry department, that is shared by local Sámi reindeer herders and forest workers. Furthermore, the state forestry department has both commercial interests and acts as the forest protecting institution. The case study shows how, by emphasizing the notion of indigeneity, the Sámi herders were able to reach the international institutions, and in so doing effectively by-passing local, regional and national institutions, in order to gain visibility and reach an agreement on a moratorium on forest felling in some of their pastures. This case shows how in this process the notions of territory and indigeneity and their definitions have played a fundamental role to achieve the results.

Re-Making Tibetan Pasturelands: The Three Rivers' Sources Region and the State*Ingo Breuer and Andreas Gruschke*

The pastureland and pastoral systems of the so-called Three Rivers' Sources (*sanjiangyuan*) region in the Qinghai part of the Tibetan Highland have recently witnessed significant transformations, initiated by what is often called "interventions of the Chinese state". Intersecting discourses related to issues such as climate change, ecology, demography, poverty reduction, and the aim of „creating an harmonious society", have



materialized in an unprecedented array of interventions in the field, e.g., the creation of infrastructure, of pasture leasehold systems, of nature reserves, and of relocation programmes. In this paper, we start on from case studies originating from fieldwork to explore the multiple and often ambiguous consequences of these interventions. Our focus is on the re-making of socio-spatial relations between pasture users and the state, manifested, for example, in new spatial relations of authority between actors in the intricate web of relations by which "the Chinese state" exerts power in those remote regions.

The space of dwelling in a world of earth and sky*Tim Ingold*

Drawing on the *nomadology* of Deleuze and Guattari, I argue that so-called nomadic people have traditionally inhabited a world of earth and sky rather than a landscape. In the hearth of the nomadic dwelling, earth and sky are unified at the centre rather than, as in the landscape, divided along the line of the horizon. This contrast between the earth-sky world and the landscape corresponds to the distinction that Deleuze and Guattari draw between the *smooth* space of nomadic life and the *striated* space of agrarian production. However, Deleuze and Guattari are wrong to confuse this distinction with that between the close-range or *haptic* perception of the environment and the kind that is based on long-range *optical* projection. This is what distinguishes the modern sense of landscape (as a regime of the *scopic*) from its pre-modern precursor.

From nomadic space to mobile space: a theoretical experiment*Denis Retaillé*

An empirical work about nomadic and peasant people encounter in East Niger during the last three decades of the 20th century guided to revise categories and concepts used to describe a "crisis". Where was it? Maybe in the categories and concepts themselves! This paper tries to show how and why. In the same time, the globalization was presented also as a crisis. The mobile space pattern based on Sahelian example could be a way to understand what is happening in the world when uncertainty is the rule. A mobile space theory must be understood as necessarily in progress, based on a new geographical axiomatic. Mobility first before anchoring, after a long geographical history based on sedentary power.

Moved by the State and Left Behind: Spatial practices of forced relocation in Chukotka, Russia*Tobias Holzlehner*

State induced resettlement policies intertwine political macro processes, local communities, and various forms of belonging in the uprooted landscape of relocation. This paper reflects on a case study of forced relocation on the Chukchi Peninsula in northeastern Russia. From the 1930s to the 1970s the inhabitants of mainly native coastal villages were subjected to a relocalization policy of the Soviet state that left dozens of settlements deserted. I argue that the Sovietization of the Russian North and the corresponding village relocations in Chukotka led to a collision of different forms of spatial practices, wherein a Soviet spatial logic was implanted on the traditional space usage of native sea mammal hunters and reindeer herders. Focusing on individual



strategies of place making amidst a relocated population, the paper addresses the central role of memory, space, and subsistence activities in relation to border landscapes and state policies.

Spatial Cognition and Socialist Enclosure: The Tunguska Experience

Joachim Otto Habeck

This presentation will provide an account of how sedentarization works in practice, more specifically, how it worked in the remote parts of the forest (taiga) zone of the Soviet Union in the 1940s and 1950s. The different aspects of the state's sedentarization campaign -- administrative restructuring, collectivization, and the development of new industrial branches -- will be illuminated through examples of official documents and responses by Evenki reindeer nomads who were affected by this policy. In particular, the focus will be on reindeer nomads' comments on how their spatial practices are subject to state-instigated change. I shall seek to develop Gail Fondahl's concept of "socialist enclosure" into something preliminarily called "cognitive enclosure", by which I mean the very palpable consequences of sedentarisation on people's perception of space and skills of moving. Examples are: learning to live in a house, unlearning certain modes of travelling, and navigating new environments.

Indigenous topographies and political territories in the Cisbaikal region of Siberia

Joseph Long

In the Cisbaikal region, Buriats engage in a complex of rituals in their ancestral homelands. Offerings to incorporeal spirits are made at the household hearth, sacred places along the road, and annual offerings are made at ancestral hearths and sacred mountains. These are often the sites of former winter camps and summer pastures and Buriats follow the migration routes of their ancestors when making offerings. These places make up a shamanist topography that contrasts the statist topography of civic places and the Soviet rationalised, economic approach to land. Following the dissolution of the Ust-Orda Buriat Autonomous Okrug in 2008, Buriats are increasingly framing ritual and the nature of the shamanist topography in public discourse. This asserts belonging to land in a context where a relationship between national identity and political space can no longer be assumed.

A Place Off the Map: The Case for a Non-Map-based Place Title

Denis Wood

I distinguish the idea of *place*, which is here, from that of *location*, which is here in relation to somewhere else; and further distinguish places which have no location from places that do. Because maps can only establish locations – which is the reason for their importance in the rise and continuing history of states – maps are irrelevant when it comes to places that lack them, the places of foragers, of herders, of mobile swidden cultivators, of Gypsies, and of the many others that states have historically had a hard time corralling. Forcing their places onto maps only damages, in some cases destroys them; but leaving them off maps renders them invisible, non-existent. I'm calling for the creation of some form of *place title* as an alternative to map-based land titles, and a reassessment of the place of maps in talk about dwelling.



Points, lines and polygons: From Inuit wayfinding to the Google World

Claudio Aporta

This presentation will discuss some preliminary ideas on how new cartographic and spatial technologies are affecting our perception of place and space. We relate to space since birth, as we gradually form our sense of self, place and regions, through dwelling and moving in the world, and through education (in the broadest sense). We discover this world (and our place in it) in an interplay of known and unknown geographies as we move along life. This presentation will reflect on how new technologies might be changing our basic relationship to the places where we live, and to space, in general. Are devices that tell us where we are and how to move decisively changing our perception of space? What does it mean to live in the super-documented Earth of Google, where *everything* is being rendered? Is there anything outside the Google *Grid*? This presentation will not provide clear answers to those questions. It will only offer some ideas about how the point, the line and the polygon have gone from being abstractions of the first GIS systems to form part of our every day lives. My work on Inuit wayfinding, and the Inuit hunters' use of maps and GPS will be the focus of the analysis.

The 'end' of the 'end of the world' idea? The influence of technological change for perceiving and producing physical and virtual spaces among remote reindeer nomads

Florian Stammler

Two most significant innovations in nomadic reindeer herding in the last 80 years have influenced the relations between nomads and their surrounding environment consisting of human and non-human persons. This presentation analyses how both the snowmobile and the mobile phone changed the way in which nomads enter conversations with their environment, in the broadest possible sense. Using two or three cases of reindeer nomads in the Russian North, I show why the snowmobile has not led to the same sort of revolution as in northern Europe, whereas the mobile phone has had instant and radical influence on the ways in which nomads conceive of, produce and use space surrounding them. Conclusions from this research contribute to an anthropology of movement and information flows and towards the never-ending debate on cognition vs dwelling.

The cognitive and ecological approaches to the study of the sacralization of the environment in the Northern pastoral and hunter-gatherer societies. Mutual exclusivity or complementarity?

Rudolf Havelka

The presented paper starts from the hypothesis that religious thinking and practice between the members of the Northern societies depend directly on natural resources (i.e. the hunter-gatherers and pastorals) are closely related to the Batesonian cybernetics of the environment itself.

The personal and social reflections of this cybernetics (obtained through the everyday activities in the environment) seem to be personalized by the people into the form of the supernatural owners of nature. Feedback action of the indigenous people towards the environment may take the form of religious ritual and



sanctioning of improper behavior is also made in religious connotation. The reason for religious way of „coding“ of the shared experience with the environment may rest in its complexity – it is only hardly expressed and shared in the verbalized form.

The Cognitive Science of Religion represents a powerful tool for the explanation of the basic religious phenomena by description of the mental processes on which are those based. Although the partial cognitive theories of religious phenomena may be correct on certain level of explanation, the premises on which are those theories based as well as the final statements made about the character of the religious thinking and practice as a whole (regarded as mere evolutionary by-products or „spandrels“) seems to be based on wrong epistemology. This error might be caused “only” by the omission of the differences between the *logical types* to which the particular phenomena taken into question belong. May, thus, after the correction in the logical typing, the cognitive and ecological approaches actually represent complementary theoretic and methodological tools, necessary for research of *one* complex phenomena, the relations between the environment and persons, undertaken on different levels?

The effects of GPS on spatial cognition of Nenets tundra nomads: From ‘invisible float’ to ‘eye for snowstorm’

Kirill Istomin

The presentation will focus on the history of the use of GPS by nomadic reindeer herders and semi-nomadic fishermen of the Taz tundra (southern part of Gydan Peninsula, north-western Siberia). It will also analyze the impact the use of GPS navigators had on the spatial cognition and the traditional methods of wayfinding of these groups. It will be demonstrated that the history of GPS adoption could be divided into 3 stages, each of which had different effect on the spatial cognition. During the first stage, GPS navigators were used for purposes unrelated to wayfinding and, therefore, they did not have significant impact on spatial cognition. During the second stage, GPS navigators started to be used for wayfinding, but only in limited range of situations, when the traditional methods of wayfinding failed. During the third stage, the range of wayfinding tasks and situations, for which GPS navigators were used, was increased. It seems like this increase depended on the relative cognitive costs and benefits of learning the traditional methods rather than relying on the GPS. Since these costs and benefits differed significantly depending on the economic activity and related patterns of spatial behavior, differences between the nomadic and semi nomadic groups in both the extent of GPS use and the mastery of traditional navigational methods can be now observed. It can be proposed, that the described three stage model can be helpful in understanding the cognitive effects of technological innovations other than GPS.

Putting Inuinnait place names on the map (film)*Béatrice Collignon*

This 15' documentary deals with the place names of the Inuinnait, a group of Inuit living in the Western Central Canadian Arctic. A survey conducted by the author in 1991-1992 in the 4 Inuinnait communities (Cambridge Bay, Umingmaktok, Kugluktuk and Ulukhaktok – Western Kitikmeot) led to the recording of 1 007 place names. The officialization process was delayed due to bureaucratic problems but on April 1st 2006 the 291 place names located in the part of Inuinnait territory that has remained in the NWT became official, and the community of Holman changed its name to Ulukhaktok. The other 716 toponyms are located in the Nunavut territory (created in 1999).

The documentary was filmed on-site in Aug. 2003 and Aug. 2004 and edited in Paris (atelier Géo-vidéo, Université de Paris 1, Panthéon-Sorbonne) in 2005-2006. It puts toponymy in its geopolitical context, tells the story of the survey and shows extracts from a meeting held in Ulukhaktok (then still called Holman) in Aug. 2003. The Elders and Youth Committee and the Inuvialuit Community Corporation gathered that evening to review a blue-print map based on the 1991-1992 survey and set up by the Territorial Toponymy Program. It was the final step before the presentation of the list of the Western Inuinnait place names before the Territorial Assembly for their official recognition.

A longer version (28') of the same documentary was also edited for the Inuinnait public, with more extracts from the meeting. French, Spanish and Italian versions are also available (short version only).

Naming places, creating landscapes: the dynamics of indigenous nomadic geographies*Béatrice Collignon*

The encounter between an environment such as the Canadian Arctic and a culture of hunters-gatherers such as that of the Inuit people has created a specific human landscape. A landscape where artefacts testifying human presence are scarce, and where dwellings leave but a light footprint on the tundra. Yet, the Inuit have indeed deeply humanized their familiar landscapes, through the very process of naming places.

Based on extended fieldwork with the Inuinnait people, an Inuit group living in Canada's Western Arctic, this paper will examine the process of creating cultural landscapes through the naming of places, and then discuss the possibility of understanding a people's perception of their landscape (a people's geography") through the study of local toponymic systems.

I will also address the issues raised by the recording of place names sets that had until now been transmitted orally only. Indeed, such surveys tend to freeze toponymic systems that were previously always dynamic, as is people's and cultures' memory. They also tend to reduce place names to mere words, deprived of the stories and geographic knowledge that were imbedded in them in such a way that, when told (and not read) they had the power to trigger the memory of everything linked to the place and its surroundings: geographic information, information related to hunting and travelling, as well as information about humans, relatives and ancestors, foreigners and other beings who live on the land.



While recording and mapping place names is certainly important, the challenge is to find ways of preserving the power of the spoken word when it is translated in a written form, that is: of keeping naming a process, and landscapes a constant re-creation.

Roundtable Discussion on Place Names and the Interrelation of State and Spatial Cognition

Gail Fondahl

(Re)naming places, (re)claiming spaces – musings from northern British Columbia

From toponymic research carried out with Tl'azt'en Nation, a Dakelh (Carrier)-speaking group of the Dene (Athabaskan) linguistic group, three nuances are identified as demanding more study – 1) the recent trend to translate exogenous toponyms to indigenous Dakelh, 2) the politicization of local debates on 'correct' etymologies of Dakelh toponyms, and 3) the recognition and regulation of über-local names in re-establishing native governance structures.

Claudio Aporta

Inuit place names are part of the Oral Geography developed and transmitted by Inuit across the circumpolar world. Each Inuit group has developed a large number of toponyms that are used to help people travel, orient, and describe places, trails, and horizons without having to resort to maps. While some Inuit place names change, some new ones are introduced, and some old ones disappear, it is remarkable that a considerable number of place names has been transmitted from generation to generation for centuries. This short presentation will look at the longevity of some Inuit place names in the Canadian Arctic, and it will propose that Inuit have made use of those names as a form of tenure over their land. In other words, a group's place names act as keys of access to the land and its resources.

Brian Donahoe

Alygdzher, the principal settlement of the indigenous Tofa people in south-central Siberia, follows the contours laid down by the Uda River, which cuts a deep swath between towering rock faces to the west and south, and lower forested ridges to the east and north. However, despite the obvious importance of these topographical features to the layout of the village, only the Uda retains its original name in the minds of the village's inhabitants. These rock faces and ridges now carry names that are either bland descriptive terms in Russian or remnants of the bygone Soviet era. In this brief presentation I want to raise a simple but profound question: What, then, is actually lost? What information, what technologies of knowing and interacting with the land, what cultural knowledge is actually lost when place names fade out of memory? Or can this information, this cultural knowledge, be successfully translated into another language without losing some of its effectiveness?

